



Economic & International Development Department

HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES

FIRST FLOOR, COUNCIL CHAMBERS

CITY 1 BUILDING, 300 N. CAMPBELL STREET

JUNE 15, 2015, 4:00 P.M.

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

The El Paso Historic Landmark Commission held a public hearing in the First Floor Council Chambers, City 1 Building, 300 N. Campbell Street, June 15, 2015, 4:00 p.m.

The following commissioners were present:

Commissioner Randy Brock

Vice-Chairman Edgar Lopez

Chairman William Helm

Commissioner George Cordova

The following commissioners were not present:

Commissioner Beatriz Lucero

Commissioner Melinda Becker Skillern

Commissioner Cesar Gomez

The following City staff members were present:

Ms. Providencia Velázquez, Historic Preservation Officer, Economic & International Development

Mr. Adam Train, Planner, Historic Preservation Office, Economic & International Development

Ms. Karla Nieman, Assistant City Attorney, City Attorney's Office

CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Helm called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m., quorum present.

CHANGES TO THE AGENDA

None.

I. CALL TO THE PUBLIC – PUBLIC COMMENT

None.

II. REGULAR AGENDA – DISCUSSION AND ACTION

Certificate of Appropriateness

1. **PHAP15-00014:** Being 130 Government Hill 1 To 19, City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
Location: 4700 Leeds Avenue
Historic District: Austin Terrace
Property Owner: Cross of Grace Church, Inc.
Representative: Jose Navarro

Economic & International Development
City 3 | 801 Texas Avenue | El Paso, Texas 79901 | (915) 212-0094
ED@elpasotexas.gov

“Delivering Outstanding Services”



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

Representative District: 2
Existing Zoning: R-4/H (Residential/Historic)
Year Built: 2000
Historic Status: Non-contributing
Request: Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a 75'-0" high telecommunications facility
Application Filed: 5/18/15
45 Day Expiration: 7/2/15
Postponed from 06/01/15 meeting

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and stated the property owner is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a 75'-0" high telecommunications facility. This request was first presented to commissioners at the June 1, 2015 meeting. At that meeting, commissioners had unanswered questions for the representative:

1. submitting a landscape plan; and
2. does the FAA (Federal Airways & Airspace) require the cell tower to be illuminated?

Since the last meeting, the representative has submitted the landscape plan and provided a summary report from the FAA. The summary report states "Notice to the FAA is not required at the analyzed location and height for slope, height or Straight-In procedures." "Notice Not Required."

Ms. Velázquez felt the representative had answered the questions from commissioners.

Chairman Helm commented on the landscape plan and the access driveway back to the pad. Chairman Helm requested the access driveway be shown on the landscape plan to ensure proposed plantings are not overlapping the access driveway.

Mr. Jose Navarro, representative, responded to comments and questions from commissioners.

MOTION:

Motion made by Vice-Chairman Lopez, seconded by Commissioner Cordova AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE PLANS WITH THE CHANGES REQUESTED AT THE LAST MEETING; WITH ADDITIONAL LANDSCAPING AROUND THE BASE OF THE TOWER AND KNOWING THAT IT IS NOT REQUIRED TO HAVE A LIGHT ON TOP.



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

2. PHAP15-00016:	Being 10 Sunset Heights 41 & E. ½ of 40 (4500 Sq Ft), City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
Location:	655 Upson Drive
Historic District:	Sunset Heights
Property Owner:	Nadia Powell
Representative:	Guido Verheyden
Representative District:	8
Existing Zoning:	A-2/H (Apartments/Historic)
Year Built:	1904
Historic Status:	Contributing
Request:	Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of an addition
Application Filed:	6/1/15
45 Day Expiration:	7/16/15

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and stated the property owner is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of an addition. The proposed addition will be constructed in the rear of the property and will be visible from the rear of the property in the alleyway.

The Historic Preservation Office recommends **APPROVAL** of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:

The Design Guidelines for El Paso's Historic Districts, Sites, and Properties recommend the following:

- *Introduce additions in locations that are not visible from the street-generally on rear elevations.*
- *Locate additions carefully so they do not damage or conceal significant building features or details.*
- *Design an addition so it is compatible in roof form, proportions, materials and details with the existing structure.*
- *Design an addition that is compatible with but, subtly different from existing historic homes in the district.*
- *Design an addition so that if removed in the future, the historic building's form and character defining features are not obscured, damaged, or destroyed.*

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:

- *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*

Ms. Nadia Powell, property owner and Mr. Guido Verheyden, father of property owner, responded to comments and questions from commissioners.



Economic & International Development Department

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Helm, seconded by Commissioner Brock AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVED BASED ON STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS.

Mayor
Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1
Peter Svarzbein

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

District 7
Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager
Tommy Gonzalez

- 3. PHAP15-00017:** Being 4 Mills 61.333 Ft. on N. Stanton X 120 Ft. Beg. 86.667 Ft. N. of Sec., City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
- Location: 209 North Stanton
Historic District: Downtown
Property Owner: Hasieran, LLC
Representative: Richard M. Dillon & Martin Morgades
Representative District: 8
Existing Zoning: C-5/H (Commercial/Historic)
Year Built: 1915
Historic Status: Contributing
Request: Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of new brick on the first floor and changing the color of the rooftop addition
- Application Filed: 6/1/15
45 Day Expiration: 7/16/15
THIS ITEM WAS WITHDRAWN.

- 4. PHAP15-00018:** Being 28 Sunset Heights 14 & W ½ of 13, City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
- Location: 917 Mundy Drive
Historic District: Sunset Heights
Property Owner: Robert Cormell
Representative: Robert Cormell
Representative District: 8
Existing Zoning: R-4/H (Residential/Historic)
Year Built: 1910
Historic Status: Contributing
Request: Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of deteriorated wood and stucco from the rear addition and replacement with engineered wood siding; removal of existing asphalt roofing and installation of asphalt shingles in "Estate Gray"
- Application Filed: 6/3/15
45 Day Expiration: 7/18/15



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and stated the property owner is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of deteriorated wood and stucco from the rear addition and replacement with engineered wood siding; removal of existing asphalt roofing and installation of asphalt shingles in “Estate Gray.” The property is located on the corner of Mundy Drive and Fewel Street. Corner properties are most vulnerable because you can see everything from the street. The addition in the rear of the property is in such poor condition that the new owner would like to stabilize, repair and re-clad the structure. The property owner is requesting SmartSide siding for the proposed addition; additionally, the proposed addition will have a new door, a crawl space with access and wood steps, and there will not be any windows. Commissioners have previously approved structures using Hardie-board for siding. The property owner is requesting removal of the T-lock shingles; T-lock shingles are no longer manufactured. Roof shingle replacement permits are approved using asphalt shingles to match the previous.

The Historic Preservation Office recommends ***APPROVAL WITH A MODIFICATION** of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:

The Design Guidelines for El Paso’s Historic Districts, Sites, and Properties recommend the following:

- *As with masonry, original wood finishes should be maintained where at all possible.*
- *If areas are deteriorated beyond repair they should be replaced in kind to match the original historic material compounds. Aluminum, vinyl, plywood or other synthetic sidings shall be reviewed by the HLC. However, some may be considered on an individual basis if fake wood grains are not used, the proposed material matches the existing historic material, all original detailing is left exposed, window and door trim are not covered, and any unique finishes are intact and not covered or damaged.*
- *If a roof requires repair, the replacement materials must match the original or existing materials as closely as possible.*

The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:

- *Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires placement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.*

***THE MODIFICATION IS THAT THE NEW ROOF COLOR SHALL BE CLOSER TO THE EXISTING COLOR.**

Ms. Velázquez explained she has seen property owners start to remove the roof only to discover layers and layers of roofing material. She had a property owner come into her office and show her a very vibrant green wood shake; therefore, when the property owner replaced the roof with asphalt shingles, she approved green asphalt shingle roof because the roof was originally green. It makes you wonder how a roof can support that much weight.



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

Per the photos, Chairman Helm stated it looks like some of the joists were failing the rafters.

Mr. Robert Cormell, property owner, thought this addition had three different roofs put on of the cedar shake. He intends to remove all layers of roof, place new OSB boarding and then re-roof the addition. Due to the sun beating down in the morning, the addition will not have any windows. The addition will be used as a laundry room.

Ms. Velázquez explained "Estate Gray" asphalt shingles are rather dark in color, almost black. She recommended the shingle color be one or two shades lighter. Ms. Velázquez showed proposed asphalt shingle color samples to commissioners.

Chairman Helm cautioned against installing the siding all the way to the ground.

Mr. Cormell suggested brick or concrete footing on the bottom so that the siding does not touch the dirt.

Vice-Chairman Lopez thanked Mr. Cormell for making these big improvements to the home, especially due to the location being on the corner. He wondered if Mr. Cormell intended to make any changes to the rockwall.

Mr. Cormell would like to open up the rear and install a gate. The wrought iron bars will be removed from the windows in the front. Additionally, the existing wheelchair ramp will be removed.

Chairman Helm requested Mr. Cormell consider using a stone or rock foundation. He insisted Mr. Cormell not allow the siding to reach ground level because doing so would be a path to rot.

Mr. Cormell responded he would not allow the siding to reach ground level.

MOTION:

Motion made by Vice-Chairman Lopez, seconded by Commissioner Cordova AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE GIVING THE PROPERTY OWNER THE OPTION TO CHOOSE THE COLOR OF THE ASPHALT SHINGLES WITH EITHER "ASPEN GRAY" OR "ESTATE GRAY" AND RECOMMEND IMPROVEMENTS TO THE BACK OF THE HOUSE WITH THE INSTALLATION OF THE SIDING AND A CONCRETE OR STONE BASE FOR THE FOUNDATION.



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

5. PHAP15-00019:	Being 7 Sunset Heights 56 To 59, City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
Location:	1100 Los Angeles
Historic District:	Sunset Heights
Property Owner:	Robert and Amy O'Rourke
Representative:	Karla Frausto
Representative District:	8
Existing Zoning:	R-4/H (Residential/Historic)
Year Built:	1904
Historic Status:	Landmark
Request:	Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of existing kitchen windows, modification of the window opening to accommodate a larger window, and replacement with a tripartite window
Application Filed:	6/10/15
45 Day Expiration:	7/25/15

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and stated the property owner is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of existing kitchen windows, modification of the window opening to accommodate a larger window, and replacement with a tripartite window. This is a Henry Trost designed house located on the corner of Yandell Drive and Los Angeles Drive. This home has been extensively renovated in the past several years; the current property owner took possession less than two weeks ago. The Historic Landmark Commission approved the installation of the three small windows in 2008; unfortunately, the property owners at that time never lived in the home. The 2008 approved modifications are still being completed. Due to lack of lighting into the kitchen, the current property owner wants to remove the current tripartite windows and install a significantly larger window. The proposed window will be almost 4.5" in height and almost 8" wide allowing a substantial amount of light in. The windows will have wood with metal cladding on the exterior. The new proposed window will only be visible from the alleyway.

The Historic Preservation Office recommends **APPROVAL** of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:

The Design Guidelines for El Paso's Historic Districts, Sites, and Properties recommend the following:

- *Doors and windows are considered important character-defining features because of significant detailing.*
- *Windows in secondary façades shall be reviewed on a case by case basis.*



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

- *Retain and preserve the pattern, arrangement, and dimensions of door and window openings on principal elevations. Often the placement of doors and windows is an indicator of a particular architectural style, and therefore contributes to the building's significance. Doors and windows for new construction and additions should be compatible in proportion, location, shape, pattern, size, and details to existing units.*
- *When repair is not feasible, door and window products will be reviewed on an individual basis using the following criteria:*
 - a. *Architectural and historical compatibility*
 - b. *Comparison to original profile*
 - c. *Level of significance of original doors and windows to the architectural style of the building.*
 - d. *Three dimensional exterior applied muntins that simulate or match the original muntins may be approved. Single dimension interior applied muntins are not appropriate.*

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:

- *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*
- *New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

Ms. Karla Frausto, representative, responded to comments and questions from commissioners.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Helm, seconded by Commissioner Brock AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE BASED ON STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS.

6. Addresses of property HLC commissioners have requested that HLC staff review or investigate and provide a report to the HLC. If no addresses are submitted in advance and listed under this agenda item, commissioners may announce such addresses under this agenda item. Discussion on property announced at this meeting will take place during the next regularly scheduled meeting. June 1, 2015 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the June 15, 2015 meeting. June 15, 2015 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be schedule for the July 6, 2015 meeting.

No requests from commissioners or staff.



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

HLC Staff Report

7. Update on Administrative Review Cases since the last HLC meeting for the properties listed on the attachment posted with this agenda. (See Attachment "A")

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Helm, seconded by Commissioner Brock AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE STAFF REPORT AS PRESENTED.

Other Business – Discussion and Action

8. Discussion on Downtown survey and map (per 11.24.2014 meeting discussion) including discussion of Certified Local Government (CLG) grant.

Ms. Velázquez explained Economic & International Development staff is continuing to meet with property owners in the area to inform them regarding this project and what the project is about. At the last Downtown Management District meeting there was not a quorum; therefore, there was no vote taken. Once the property owners receive and understand the information presented to them, the number of objections to the project decreases. Ms. Velázquez thought the grant should be presented to City Council by the end of this month or the beginning of the next. This means that the contract deadline will be extended but the project deadline is not. We will have to submit a completed project by September 2016.

Chairman Helm asked what course of action commissioners should take to show a sign of support to City Council.

Ms. Velázquez responded the more comments from the public, property owners and individuals affected by this project that City Council hears, the more likely City Council will approve this. Advocates (meaning members of the El Paso County Historical Commission) have told her that several City Council representatives are on board and they do understand what this project means for the city and citizens of El Paso. Furthermore, these City Council representatives understand there are no restrictions, there will be available tax credits for these property owners, and that once the nomination is approved property owners will always have the option to demolish.

Ms. Nieman explained commissioners have purview to make recommendations to Council that validate this project. If commissioners feel this is in the interest of this commission to provide combined guidance on what City Council should do regarding the grant then commissioners should send a letter of recommendation in support of the survey.

Chairman Helm asked if commissioners should write a formal letter to City Council or ...



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

Ms. Nieman responded commissioners could submit a letter to City Council or make a recommendation on the floor in support of the project. Should commissioners decide to submit a formal letter supporting the project, that letter will be presented to City Council as part of the record.

Vice-Chairman Lopez thought commissioners should submit a formal letter supporting the project to the City Council.

Ms. Velázquez hoped the grant would be presented to City Council before the next HLC meeting on July 6th.

Chairman Helm stated he would be happy to draft a letter in support of the grant.

Vice-Chairman Lopez requested commissioners in support of the grant be permitted to sign the letter as well.

Ms. Velázquez suggested Chairman Helm compose the letter and email it to her, she will then forward the letter to the commissioners. She would request commissioners add their thoughts, comments, additions and/or corrections, if necessary.

MOTION:

Motion made by Vice-Chairman Lopez, seconded by Commissioner Cordova AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO COMMISSION THE CHAIRMAN TO PREPARE A LETTER SUPPORTING THE SURVEY.

9. Approval of Regular Meeting Minutes for June 1, 2015

No comments from commissioners.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Helm, seconded by Commissioner Brock AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE MEETING MINUTES FOR JUNE 1, 2015.

ABSTAIN: Commissioner Skillern

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Helm, seconded by Commissioner Brock AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADJOURN THE MEETING AT 5:14 P.M.